

The City College of New York
Interim Progress Report for Year Five

Instructions and Template

November 30, 2022

Contents

1. Instructions and Template Guidelines
2. Executive Summary of the Most Recent Visit
3. Template
 - a. Progress in Addressing Not-Met Conditions and Student Performance Criteria identified in the review of the previous Interim Progress Report.
 - b. Changes or Planned Changes in the Program
 - c. Summary of Preparations for Adapting to 2020 NAAB Conditions
 - d. Appendix (Include revised curricula and syllabi. Syllabi shall reference which NAAB SPC a course addresses and which 2020 PC and SC it will address; samples of required student work).
4. Requirements for the Use of Digital Content in Interim Progress Reports

1. INSTRUCTIONS AND TEMPLATE GUIDELINES

Purpose

Continuing accreditation is subject to the submission of interim progress reports at defined intervals after an eight-year or four-year term of continuing accreditation is approved.

This narrative report, supported by documentation, covers three areas:

1. The program's correction of not-met Conditions or Student Performance Criteria from the previous Interim Progress Report.
2. Significant changes to the program or the institution since the last visit.
3. Summary of Preparations for Adapting to 2020 NAAB Conditions.

Supporting Documentation

1. Evidence must be provided for each Condition and SPC "not met," including detailed descriptions of changes to the curriculum that have been made in response to not-met SPC that were identified in the review of the previous Interim Progress Report. Identify any specific outcomes expected to student performance. Attach new or revised annotated syllabi identifying changes for required courses that address unmet SPC.
2. Provide information regarding changes in leadership or faculty membership. Identify the anticipated contribution to the program for new hires and include either a narrative biography or one-page CV.
3. Evidence of student work is required for SPCs 'not met' in the most recent VTR.
 - Provide three examples of minimum-pass work for each deficiency and submit student work evidence to NAAB in electronic format. (Refer to the "Guidelines for Submitting Digital Content in IPRs" for the required format and file organization.)
 - All student work evidence must be labeled and clearly annotated so that each example cross-references the specific SPC being evaluated and shows compliance with that SPC.
4. Provide additional information that may be of interest to the NAAB team at the next accreditation visit.

Outcomes

IPRs are reviewed by a panel of three: one current NAAB director, one former NAAB director, and one experienced team chair.¹ The panel may make one of three recommendations to the Board regarding the interim report:

1. Accept the interim fifth-year report as having demonstrated satisfactory progress toward addressing deficiencies identified in the most recent VTR;
2. Reject the fifth-year interim report as having not demonstrated sufficient progress toward addressing deficiencies and advance the next accreditation sequence by at least one but not more than three calendar years. In such cases, the chief academic officer of the institution will be notified with copies to the program administrator and a schedule will be determined so that the program has at least six months to prepare an APR.
3. The annual statistical report (See Section 9 of the 2015 Procedures)) is still required in either case.

Deadline and Contacts

IPRs are due on November 30. They shall be submitted through the NAAB's Annual Report System (ARS). As described in Section 10 of the 2015 NAAB Procedures for Accreditation "...the program will be assessed a fine of \$100.00 per calendar day until the IPR is submitted." If the IPR is not received by January 15, the program will automatically receive Outcome 3 described above. Email questions to accreditation@naab.org.

¹ The team chair will not have participated in the visiting team during the year in which the original decision on a term of accreditation was made.

Instructions

- 1. Reports shall be succinct and are limited to 40 pages/20 MBs, including supporting documentation.**
2. Type all responses in the designated text areas.
3. Reports must be submitted as a single PDF following the template format. Pages should be numbered.
4. Supporting documentation should be included in the body of the report.
5. Remove the #4 "Requirements for the Use of Digital Content in Interim Progress Reports" pages before submitting the interim progress report.

2. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY OF 2017 NAAB VISIT

CONDITIONS NOT MET

2017 VTR
none

STUDENT PERFORMANCE CRITERIA NOT MET

2017 VTR
B.3 Codes and Regulations

3. TEMPLATE

Interim Progress Report

The City College of New York

Bernard and Anne Spitzer School of Architecture

Bachelor of Architecture (freshman admission + 160 semester credits)

Master of Architecture (non-preprofessional degree + 108 semester credits)

Year of the previous visit: 2017

Please update contact information as necessary since the last APR was submitted.

Chief administrator for the academic unit in which the program is located:

Name: Marta Gutman

Title: Dean, Bernard and Anne Spitzer School of Architecture

Email Address: mgutman@ccny.cuny.edu

Physical Address:

Bernard and Anne Spitzer School of Architecture

The City College of New York

141 Convent Avenue

New York, NY 10031

Any questions pertaining to this submission will be directed to the chief administrator for the academic unit in which the program is located.

Chief academic officer for the Institution:

Name: Vincent Boudreau

Title: President, The City College of New York

Email Address: vboudreau@ccny.cuny.edu

Physical Address:

Office of the President

The City College of New York

Wille Administration Building

Rm. 300

160 Convent Avenue

New York, NY 10031

Text from the VTR and IPR Year Two review is in the gray text boxes. Type your response in the designated text boxes.

I. Progress in Addressing Not-Met Conditions and Student Performance Criteria

a. Progress in Addressing Not-Met Conditions

N/A

b. Progress in Addressing Not-Met Student Performance Criteria

B.3 Codes and Regulations

2017 Visiting Team Assessment: The team did not find sufficient evidence to indicate that this criterion is met at the ability level for both the B. Arch and M. Arch programs as required by the NAAB. The team requested additional evidence, which was provided by the school. The team was still unable to locate appropriate material.

The City College of the City University of New, 2019 Response:

B. Arch: In reviewing AES 24501 – Construction Technology 1 and ARCH 36101 – Core Studio 6 (Integration), the team found insufficient evidence that this criterion was met.

M. Arch: In reviewing ARCH 62100 – Architecture Studio 1.2 and ARCH 73100 Architecture Studio 1.3, the team insufficient evidence that this criterion was met.

The City College of New York, 2019 Response: Since the last NAAB team visit in 2017, the Spitzer School leadership and faculty have strengthened instruction in the area of Codes and Regulations in both our accredited professional programs in a number of required courses in the following ways:

B. Arch Program: In the fall of 2nd year, ARCH 35302 Site Technology, includes a lecture (week 10) on “Rules and Regulations” which covers zoning codes in New York City and more generally, in the spring of 2nd year, AES 24501 Construction Tech I includes a lecture (week 2) on “Regulatory Requirements & Constraints” which covers building codes. In the spring of 3rd year, ARCH 36100 Core Studio 6, the “integration” studio, requires students to apply knowledge of codes and regulations, including ADA requirements, in the development of the design of a building.

M.Arch Program: In the fall of 1st year, ARCH 73500 Site Design includes a lecture (week 10) on “Rules and Regulations” which covers zoning codes in New York City. More generally, in the spring of 2nd year, ARCH 74100 Architecture Studio 1.4, the “integrated design” studio, requires students to research and apply knowledge of codes and regulations, including ADA requirements, in the development of the design of a building. Students are required to develop a full set of construction documents to a level of detail sufficient for successful code compliance review by New York City’s Department of Buildings.

[Supporting materials were included in the appendix.]

The City College of New York, 2022 Response:

Since 2019, SPC B.3 (Codes and Regulations) has been more thoroughly integrated into both the B.Arch. and M.Arch. programs in addition to the curricular modifications mentioned in the 2019 report. In addition, students demonstrate this SPC through outputs in design studios.

B.Arch. Program: In the B. Arch. program, ARCH 36100 (Core Studio 6) focuses on the comprehensive design of a public building. Each student incorporates egress codes, occupancy loads, and ADA compliant ramps, stairs, and bathrooms into their drawings and models.

M.Arch. Program: In the spring semester of the first year of the M. Arch program, students in ARCH 62100 (Architecture Studio 2) incorporate into their projects’ occupancy loads, zoning

regulations, and ADA-compliant dimensions for bathrooms and residences, using inclusive design regulations outlined in the New York City Multiple Dwelling Law, New York City Building Codes, and International Building Code.

II. Changes or Planned Changes in the Program

Please report such changes as the following: faculty retirement/succession planning; administration changes (dean, department chair, provost); changes in enrollment (increases, decreases, new external pressures); new opportunities for collaboration; changes in financial resources (increases, decreases, external pressures); significant changes in educational approach or philosophy; changes in physical resources (e.g., deferred maintenance, new building planned, cancellation of plans for new building).

The City College of New York, 2022 Response:

Faculty Retirement/Succession Planning:

Four full-time, tenured professors have retired since 2017 and Distinguished Professor Michael Sorkin passed away in March 2020. Since 2017, five tenure-track professors have been hired:

- Assistant Professor Mohammad Bolhassani is the Spitzer School's second, full-time structural engineer who teaches required courses on structures and advanced electives;
- Assistant Professor Jerome Haferd, a licensed architect, teaches architectural design studios and advanced electives;
- Associate Professor Shawn Rickenbacker teaches architectural design studios and is the director of the Spitzer School's J. Max Bond Center for Urban Futures, an outreach and resource center serving the school's local and wider communities. This position was vacant when the NAAB team visited in 2017.
- Assistant Professor Laura Wainer, an architect and urban planner, teaches design studios and advanced electives;
- Assistant Professor Zihao Zhang is a landscape architect who teaches primarily in the Master of Landscape Architecture Program. He also offers advanced electives that are enrolled with students in the B.Arch. and M.Arch. programs.

Additionally, Cassim Shepard, an urban planner and urbanist, has joined the faculty as a Distinguished Lecturer, a renewable full-time, non-tenure track position. Finally, the Spitzer School has launched a search for a new, tenure-track assistant professor of architecture with an emphasis on design and sustainability, with an anticipated start date of Fall 2023. The Spitzer School does not foresee additional hires in the immediate future.

(See appendix for CV's)

Administrative Changes:

Since 2017, the Spitzer School has witnessed changes in leadership in the dean position. Professor Gordon Gebert served as interim dean from 2015 until 2019, when he returned to the full-time faculty. An international search in Spring 2019 led to the appointment of Leslie Lokko as dean in December 2019, until she resigned and left Spitzer in December 2020. She was succeeded by Associate Professor Bradley Horn who served, in a temporary capacity, as interim dean through Fall 2021. Professor Marta Gutman was subsequently appointed interim dean and became the Spitzer School's permanent dean in Spring 2022, following another international search. Despite changes in leadership in the dean's position prior to 2022, there has been continuity in the chair's position. The former is appointed by the college president and the latter is elected by the full-time faculty for a three-year term. Associate Professor Julio Salcedo Fernandez remained chair until 2019, Professor June Williamson was chair from 2019-2022, and Associate Professor Sean Weiss started a three-year term in July 2022 after having served as deputy chair for a year and a half under former Chair Williamson.

The college provost, Dr. Tony Liss, an internationally known physicist with research experience at the world's highest energy accelerators, was appointed in March 2018, after the NAAB team visited in 2017. He is an experienced and highly capable administrator, having served as dean of science, a very large and complex division at the City College of New York.

(See appendix for CV's)

New Opportunities for Collaboration:

The Spitzer School has restarted its travel abroad programs after a university-wide pause since the COVID pandemic in Spring 2020. Starting in Spring 2023, students will have the opportunity to travel to study abroad programs Barcelona, Madrid, and Munich.

In Spring 2017, the New York City-based firm CetraRuddy sponsored a housing studio at the Spitzer School. The Spitzer School is in ongoing conversations with the firm to restart this initiative in anticipation of launching another sponsored design studio.

Changes in Enrollment:

The chart below shows the yearly enrollments of entering and enrolled students since 2017. As the enrollment numbers show, the numbers peaked in 2020, but they have not changed significantly and there continues to be growth since 2017.

Entering Students	2017	2018	2019	2020	2021	2022
B.Arch.	88	74	85	70	75	61
M.Arch.	22	28	29	36	27	33
Enrolled Students						
B.Arch.	290	292	392	322	329	319
M.Arch.	73	71	76	91	87	86

Changes in Financial Resources:

The table below shows the total annual revenue of the Spitzer School since 2017. Thanks to the Spitzer School's endowment, total revenue has increased. Because the endowment is based on market investment, it is subject to market volatility, with notable downturns in 2018 and 2020. The 2022 revenue high was a response to a market upturn, stimulus monies, and funding for union mandated salary increases. The Spitzer School's revenue is also based on enrollment. Although enrollment has remained stable, per the above chart, at the Spitzer School, enrollment has decreased across the college, leading to a loss of overall college revenue. In 2017, the combined undergraduate and graduate enrollment totaled 15,802; in 2022, the combined total dropped to 14,116. As a result, the City College of New York anticipates budget cuts for Fall 2023, cuts that will impact the Spitzer School. Details about budget cuts are expected in January 2023, and they will likely impact the budgets for adjunct faculty and Temp Services, a funding stream for personnel comprising College Assistants, Tutors, and Administrative Adjuncts. Due to the terms of the gift, the Spitzer School's endowment cannot be used to offset these shortfalls.

	2017	2018	2019	2020	2021	2022
Total Revenue	\$4,825,244.00	\$4,014,345.00	\$6,022,062.00	\$4,809,000.00	\$5,004,000.00	\$7,021,061.00

Significant Changes in Educational Approach or Philosophy:

Two principal changes in educational approach or philosophy bear mention. First, former Dean Lesley Lokko introduced the “Unit System” in the M.Arch. program, first implemented in Fall 2020. This change had three principal outcomes that impact students in their second and third years, after completing a foundation year, following the existing curriculum. First, it meant increasing the number of credits and hours that second- and third-year M.Arch. students in studio courses. Second, it brought co-teaching into the studio unit, usually with one or two instructors in addition to the lead instructor. Third, it introduced year-long studio projects in the second and third years, with a focus on research in the first semester and on design implementation in the second. In practice, this system has required M.Arch. students to include an additional three hours to complement studio. To pilot this program, M.Arch. students enroll in a three-hour architecture elective that is affiliated with the studio and taught by one of the co-instructors. The Spitzer School is currently undertaking a rigorous assessment of these changes. This system has neither been adopted nor implemented in the B.Arch. Program.

The second shift in educational approach or philosophy relates to the ongoing impacts of the George Floyd murder and the BLM movement on the Spitzer School. As one of the most culturally diverse architecture schools in the nation, the Spitzer School has taken a vocal, anti-racist stance to uphold the experiences of our student body. The Spitzer School has implemented the following:

- The dean’s office launched, in Spring 2021, the Justice, Equity, Diversity, and Inclusion (JEDI) Committee, comprised of students, staff, and faculty to address anti-racism within the academy and the design professions. Among other projects, the Spitzer School adopted, in Spring 2022, a Racial Equity Statement penned by this committee.
- Hour SSA is a semesterly event that kicks off the start of every studio at the Spitzer School with an open dialogue about anti-racism.
- The Change Maker Scholarship acknowledges students who proactively work on behalf of the school community to change it for the better. The three current student scholars are investigating, respectively, studio culture, hands-on material explorations, and recycling materials throughout the school.
- The Spitzer School has awarded its first two Spitzer Fellows. They are part of a fellowship program to support up-and-coming designers, practitioners, planners, spatial activists, advocates, historians, and other academics outside the CUNY system in their research in architecture, landscape architecture, sustainability, or urban design, with the goal of making the Spitzer School a hub of innovation that advances racial and gender justice.

Changes in Physical Resources:

The physical resources at the Spitzer School remain principally the same since 2017. The school remains housed in its own building on the City College of New York’s campus. One challenge has been the deferred repair of a leaking roof; it is anticipated that this repair will be completed during late 2023 and early 2024. Since 2017, the building has also gained several enhancements with the goal of providing resources to students. They include:

- Two printing and plotting workstations in studio space on the second and third floors to supplement the school's principal computer and printing lab;
- A digital fabrication lab;
- A robotics lab;
- An advanced building construction laboratory for applied research in building technology, materials, and construction;
- A materials library and exhibit;
- A FarmBot has been installed inside the building and another has been installed on the roof, incorporated into our Solar Roofpod garden.
- In December 2022, the architecture library expanded into an additional room to create the Sorkin Reading Room, dedicated to its namesake, Michael Sorkin, the late distinguished professor of architecture. The room contains the generously donated collection of close to 4,000 items from his archive.

III. Summary of Preparations for Adapting to [2020 NAAB Conditions](#)

Please provide a brief description of actions taken or plans for adapting your curriculum/ classes to engage the 2020 Conditions.

In Spring 2022, an ad hoc committee of the Spitzer School's departmental curriculum committee began an ongoing study of the implementation the 2020 NAAB Conditions. This ad hoc committee is currently developing a proposal for curricular changes. Per the Spitzer School's bylaws, the committee's proposal will undergo a two-step approval processes, first by the curriculum committee and then by the faculty council (comprised of the full-time faculty). The Spitzer School is on track to approve these changes in Spring 2023 with implementation in Fall 2023.

The City College of New York, 2022 Response:

IV. Appendix (include revised curricula, syllabi, and one-page CVs or bios of new administrators and faculty members; syllabi should reference which NAAB SPC a course addresses. Provide three examples of minimum-pass student work for each SPC 'not met' in the most recent VTR.)

The City College of New York, 2022 Response: [See Appendix for this information](#)